

APPENDIX O. IDENTIFICATION OF WILDERNESS CHARACTERISTICS ON NON-WSA LANDS MANAGED BY MONTICELLO BLM

O.1 BACKGROUND

O1.1 THE 1999 UTAH WILDERNESS INVENTORY

Subsequent to the establishment of the Wilderness Study Areas (WSAs), there has been considerable debate as to whether additional lands qualify, and should be considered, for congressional wilderness designation. Charges that the Utah BLM improperly omitted qualifying areas in the inventory lead to hearings before Congress and the most intractable controversy over any resource inventory since the passage of FLPMA.

As a result of the debate (and a significant passage of time since the BLM's original inventories), in 1996 the Department of the Interior (DOI) directed the BLM to take another look at some of the lands in question. In response to the direction of the Secretary of the Interior, the BLM inventoried approximately 3,105,300 acres of BLM-managed lands that were then proposed for wilderness designation in H.R. 1500. As a result of the inventory, the BLM determined that approximately 2,712,100 of these acres have wilderness characteristics as prescribed in the Wilderness Act, and 393,200 acres do not have wilderness characteristics. Approximately 490,744 of the acres determined to have wilderness characteristics and approximately 80,731 of the acres determined to not have wilderness characteristics are public lands managed by the Monticello Field Office (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory and revisions). Refer to Table O.1 for a list of areas and acres involved.

O1.2 GUIDANCE SUBSEQUENT TO THE 1999 UTAH WILDERNESS INVENTORY

The BLM's manual for wilderness inventory, "Wilderness Inventory and Study Procedures Handbook" (H-1630-1), was rescinded on September 29, 2003 by Bureau of Land Management (BLM) Instruction Memorandum 2003-274, "BLM Implementation of the Settlement of Utah v. Norton Regarding Wilderness Study." On October 23, 2003 Instruction Memorandum 2003-275, Change 1, "Consideration of Wilderness Characteristics in Land-use Plans," was issued and became the sole written guidance for the consideration of non-WSA lands with wilderness characteristics in the land-use planning process until the revised land-use Planning Handbook was published in 2005. Instruction Memorandum 2003-275, Change 1 states that "the BLM may consider information on wilderness characteristics, along with information on other uses and values, when preparing land-use plans."

The guidance also states that the consideration of non-WSA lands with wilderness characteristics in the land-use planning process has the potential for three distinct outcomes:

- 1) to give priority to other uses over the protection of wilderness characteristics;
- 2) to give priority to other uses, but applying management restrictions to protect some or all of the wilderness characteristics; or
- 3) to give priority to the protection of wilderness characteristics.

The current BLM land-use Planning Handbook (H-1601-1, 2005) states that land-use plans must:

Identify decisions to protect or preserve wilderness characteristics (naturalness, outstanding opportunities for solitude, and outstanding opportunities for primitive and unconfined recreation). Include goals and objectives to protect the resource and management actions necessary to achieve these goals and objectives. For authorized activities, include conditions of use that would avoid or minimize impacts to wilderness characteristics.

The land-use Planning Handbook also authorizes the BLM to consider wilderness proposals from the public during the land-use planning process.

O1.3 WILDERNESS CHARACTERISTICS REVIEW

Subsequent to the 1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory and either prior to or during scoping for the Monticello RMP, the BLM received new information from the Southern Utah Wilderness Alliance (SUWA) concerning several areas. In response to this information, Monticello BLM's Interdisciplinary Team reviewed the new information in conjunction with other available information, and made findings regarding whether or not wilderness characteristics exist. Refer to Section O.2.2 for information on the review process.

O1.4 OVERVIEW OF WILDERNESS CHARACTERISTICS REVIEW PROCESS

The Monticello BLM used an interdisciplinary team to review all of the SUWA-proposed wilderness areas that had not been already established as WSAs or inventoried in the 1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory.

In addition to reviewing digital aerial photos from 2006, the BLM used other GIS information, including county road data (previously verified as part of travel plan formulation), county intrusion data, and BLM files for such resource uses as range improvements and community pits. The review identified impacted areas, as well as those areas that appeared relatively free of impacts on naturalness. The Monticello BLM also relied upon specialists' field experience within each of these areas to assist in determining whether these units possess wilderness character.

IM 275-Change 1, unlike the revoked *Wilderness Inventory and Study Procedures Handbook*, does not mention size as an essential wilderness characteristic. However, the Monticello BLM took into consideration the language of the 1964 Wilderness Act, and concluded that a size criterion is an important indicator of whether or not outstanding opportunities for solitude and/or primitive recreation exist. Areas of less than 5,000 acres are *generally* not large enough to provide for these opportunities. However, there were areas, which were less than 5,000 acres that were reviewed, because it was determined that they could, in fact, provide for these opportunities.

Although there were areas of less than 5,000 acres that were reviewed for Wilderness Characteristics, in general, the size criterion of 5,000 acres was applied only to "stand-alone" units; that is, units not contiguous with other federal lands previously determined to possess wilderness characteristics (including designated wilderness, WSAs, WIAs with wilderness characteristics, and National Park Service and U.S. Forest Service lands that are administratively endorsed for wilderness). Units that are contiguous to federal lands with wilderness characteristics as identified above were evaluated for naturalness alone because size and

outstanding opportunities for solitude and/or primitive recreation were assumed to be present in association with the larger contiguous area.

Table O1 presents the lands inventoried in the 1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory (revised 2003).

Table O.1 Non-WSA Lands Inventoried in the 1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory (revised 2003), Total Acreage, and Acreage with Wilderness Characteristics (WC) and without Wilderness Characteristics (NWC)

Name (areas marked with an asterisk are contiguous with a WSA of the same name)	Total Acreage of Inventoried Unit	Acreage with Wilderness Characteristics (WC)	Total BLM Acres not Brought Forward (NWC)¹
Arch and Mule Canyons	13,600	0	13,600
*Bridger Jack Mesa	27,300	23,254	4,046
*Butler Wash	3,000	1,661	1,339
*Cheesebox Canyon	16,080	13,244	2,836
Comb Ridge	16,400	13,763	2,637
*Cross Canyon	2,100	1,355	745
*Dark Canyon	67,400	66,325	1,075
*Fish Creek Canyon	28,480	26,649	1,831
Fort Knocker Canyon	12,800	12,409	391
Gooseneck	3,600	3,571	29
*Grand Gulch	49,570	47,109	2,461
Gravel and Long Canyons	37,100	36,933	167
Harmony Flat	10,200	9,660	540
Harts Point	57,796	26,214	31,582
*Indian Creek	20,850	18,937	1,913
*Mancos Mesa	73,900	62,190	11,710
Nokai Dome	94,189	94,189	0
*Road Canyon	13,960	11,377	2,583
San Juan River	14,700	14,338	362
Sheep Canyon	4,700	3,998	702
*Squaw & Papoose Canyon	3,750	3,568	182
Totals	571,475	490,744	80,731

¹ Although the 1999 inventory evaluated State lands for wilderness character, the BLM has no authority to manage such areas for wilderness characteristics. Therefore, no State lands are being carried forward into the DEIS.

Table O2 displays all other non-WSA lands currently proposed for wilderness, and findings by the BLM Interdisciplinary review team.

Table O.2 Other Non-WSA Lands Proposed for Wilderness, Total Acreage, and Acreage with and without Wilderness Characteristics

External Proposal Area (Name)	Total Acres¹	Acres Possessing Wilderness Characteristics (WC)²	Acres Not Possessing Wilderness Characteristics (NWC)	Comments
Allen Canyon 1	2,330	0	2,330	Size too small and contiguous to lands with NWC
Allen Canyon 2	307	0	307	Size too small and contiguous to lands with NWC
Allen Canyon 4	281	0	281	Size too small and contiguous to lands with NWC
Allen Canyon 5	3,491	0	3,491	Size too small and contiguous to lands with NWC
Arch Canyon 1	4,461	0	4,461	Not natural in appearance due to wood cutting & vegetation treatments
Arch Canyon 2	1,819	0	1,819	Size too small and contiguous to lands with NWC
Arch Canyon 3	26	0	26	Not natural in appearance due to paved road and other routes
Arch Canyon 4	46	46	0	Natural in appearance and contiguous to Mule Canyon WSA
Arch Canyon 5	2,111	0	2,111	Size too small and contiguous to lands with NWC
Arch Canyon 6	2,691	0	2,691	Size too small and contiguous to lands with NWC
Bridger Jack Mesa	564	564	0	Natural in appearance and contiguous to Bridger Jack Mesa WC
Bridger Jack Mesa 2	17	0	17	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)
Bridger Jack Mesa 3	18	0	18	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)
Bridger Jack Mesa 5	33	0	33	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)
Bridger Jack Mesa 6	2	0	2	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)
Butler Wash 7	43	0	43	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)
Copper Point 1	820	0	820	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)
Copper Point 2	3,595	0	3,595	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)

Table O.2 Other Non-WSA Lands Proposed for Wilderness, Total Acreage, and Acreage with and without Wilderness Characteristics

External Proposal Area (Name)	Total Acres¹	Acres Possessing Wilderness Characteristics (WC)²	Acres Not Possessing Wilderness Characteristics (NWC)	Comments
Dark Canyon 1	27	0	27	Not natural in appearance due to multiple routes
Dark Canyon 2	90	0	90	Not natural in appearance due to multiple routes
Dark Canyon 6	13	0	13	Not natural in appearance due to multiple routes
Dark Canyon 7	22	0	22	Not natural in appearance due to multiple routes
Dark Canyon 8	10	0	10	Not natural in appearance due to multiple routes
Dark Canyon 9	11	0	11	Not natural in appearance due to multiple routes
Dark Canyon 10	22	0	22	Not natural in appearance due to multiple routes
Dark Canyon 11	63	0	63	Not natural in appearance due to multiple routes
Dark Canyon 12	35	0	35	Not natural in appearance due to multiple routes
Dark Canyon 13	122	0	122	Not natural in appearance due to multiple routes
Dark Canyon 16	28	0	28	Not natural in appearance due to multiple routes
Fish Owl Creek Cyns1	75	0	75	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)
Fish Owl Creek Cyns2	53	0	53	Not natural in appearance due to general disturbances – multiple routes
Fish Owl Creek Cyns3	134	0	134	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)
Gooseneck 4	241	0	241	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)
Grand Gulch A	7,485	7,485	0	Natural in appearance and is contiguous to Grand Gulch ISA (Pine Canyon WSA)
Grand Gulch B	643	643	0	Natural in appearance and is contiguous to WSA
Grand Gulch 13	68	0	68	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)

Table O.2 Other Non-WSA Lands Proposed for Wilderness, Total Acreage, and Acreage with and without Wilderness Characteristics

External Proposal Area (Name)	Total Acres¹	Acres Possessing Wilderness Characteristics (WC)²	Acres Not Possessing Wilderness Characteristics (NWC)	Comments
Grand Gulch 14	246	0	246	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)
Hammond Canyon	4,702	4,702	0	Natural in appearance and has outstanding opportunities for solitude and primitive recreation and contiguous to Grand Gulch ISA and WC
Hatch Lockhart Hart 1	12,578	0	12,578	Natural in appearance but lacks outstanding opportunities for solitude and primitive recreation
Hatch Lockhart Hart 2	7,563	0	7,563	Not natural in appearance due to multiple routes, and a permanent cow camp and cabin
Hatch Lockhart Hart 3	1,765	1,765	0	Natural in appearance and contiguous to WC
Hatch Lockhart Hart 4	225	0	225	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)
Hatch Lockhart Hart 5	398	0	398	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)
Hatch Lockhart Hart 6	180	0	180	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)
Hatch Lockhart Hart 7	278	0	278	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)
Hatch Lockhart Hart 9	131	0	131	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)
Hatch Lockhart Hart 11	11	0	11	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)
Hatch Lockhart Hart 23	204	0	204	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)
Indian Creek A	3,916	3,916	0	Natural in appearance and contiguous to Indian Creek WC and Canyonlands NP AE
Indian Creek B	100	100	0	Natural in appearance and contiguous to Indian Creek WC and Canyonlands NP AE
Indian Creek C	293	293	0	Natural in appearance and contiguous to Indian Creek WC and Canyonlands NP AE

Table O.2 Other Non-WSA Lands Proposed for Wilderness, Total Acreage, and Acreage with and without Wilderness Characteristics

External Proposal Area (Name)	Total Acres¹	Acres Possessing Wilderness Characteristics (WC)²	Acres Not Possessing Wilderness Characteristics (NWC)	Comments
Indian Creek Adjustment	26	26	0	Natural in appearance and contiguous to Indian Creek WC and Canyonlands NP AE
Indian Creek 3	13	13	0	This is a correction to a mapping error; this unit does have wilderness characteristics and is part of the Indian Creek Wilderness Study Area.
Indian Creek 4	43	0	43	Not natural in appearance due to multiple routes
Lime Creek	5,556	5,556	0	Natural in appearance and has outstanding opportunities for solitude or primitive recreation
Monument Canyon	18,178	0	18,178	Not natural in appearance due to multiple routes and seismic lines
Nokai Dome 2	58	0	58	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)
Red Rock Plateau 2	28	0	28	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)
Red Rock Plateau A	17,011	17,011	0	Natural in appearance and has outstanding opportunities for solitude and primitive recreation
Red Rock Plateau B	38,918	0	38,918	Not natural in appearance due to multiple access routes
Red Rock Plateau C	6,195	0	6,195	Not natural in appearance due to multiple access routes
Road Canyon	163	163	0	Natural in appearance and contiguous to Road Canyon WSA
San Juan River A	36	0	36	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)
Shay Mountain 1	188	0	188	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)
Shay Mountain A	6,708	6,708	0	Natural in appearance and has outstanding opportunities for solitude and primitive recreation
Shay Mountain B	7,149	0	7,149	Not natural in appearance due to multiple access routes and vegetative treatments (chaining).
Shay Mountain C	973	0	973	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)

Table O.2 Other Non-WSA Lands Proposed for Wilderness, Total Acreage, and Acreage with and without Wilderness Characteristics

External Proposal Area (Name)	Total Acres ¹	Acres Possessing Wilderness Characteristics (WC) ²	Acres Not Possessing Wilderness Characteristics (NWC)	Comments
The Needle A	3,717	0	3,717	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)
The Needle B	7,023	0	7,023	Not natural in appearance due to evidence of mining activities and a permanent cow camp
The Tabernacle A	6,459	0	6,459	Natural in appearance, but has no outstanding opportunities for solitude or primitive recreation
The Tabernacle B	982	0	982	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)
Tin Cup Mesa	15,897	0	15,897	Not natural in appearance due to multiple vehicle routes and seismic lines
Upper Red Canyon A	24,918	24,918	0	Natural in appearance and has outstanding opportunities for solitude and primitive recreation
Upper Red Canyon B	158	0	158	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)
Valley of the Gods A	13,668	13,668	0	Natural in appearance and has outstanding opportunities for solitude and primitive recreation
Valley of the Gods B	891	0	891	Not natural in appearance due to multiple vehicle routes, backcountry airstrip, and seismic lines
White Canyon	6,292	6,292	0	Natural in appearance and has outstanding opportunities for solitude and primitive recreation.
White Canyon 1	1,140	0	1,140	Not natural in appearance due to multiple routes
White Canyon 2	178	0	178	Not natural in appearance due to multiple routes
White Canyon 3	636	0	636	Not natural in appearance due to multiple routes
White Canyon 4	231	0	231	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)
White Canyon 5	84	0	84	Not natural in appearance due to mining disturbance
White Canyon 6	12	0	12	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)

Table O.2 Other Non-WSA Lands Proposed for Wilderness, Total Acreage, and Acreage with and without Wilderness Characteristics

External Proposal Area (Name)	Total Acres ¹	Acres Possessing Wilderness Characteristics (WC) ²	Acres Not Possessing Wilderness Characteristics (NWC)	Comments
White Canyon 7	191	0	191	Not natural in appearance due to multiple routes
White Canyon 8	381	381	0	Natural in appearance and contiguous to Cheesebox Canyon WSA
White Canyon 9	1,238	1,238	0	Natural in appearance and contiguous to Gravel/Long WC
White Canyon 10	1,228	0	1,228	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)
White Canyon 11	124	0	124	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)
White Canyon 14	39	0	39	Not natural in appearance due to multiple routes
White Canyon 15	38	0	38	Size too small and contiguous to NWC (1999 Utah Wilderness Inventory)
White Canyon 17	30	0	30	This is a correction to a digitizing error and this unit does have wilderness characteristics. It is contiguous to a WSA.
Totals	251,185	95,488	155,697	

¹ Public lands managed by the Monticello FO. Excludes acreage encompassed by state lands, wilderness study areas, and lands inventoried in 1999 and found by the BLM to lack wilderness characteristics.

² Acres judged by the BLM as likely to possess wilderness characteristics.

The acreage described in the tables shown above, when added to acreage within WSAs, encompasses the totality of acreage included in external wilderness proposals.

A complete record of findings regarding non-WSA lands with wilderness characteristics can be found in the Administrative Record accompanying the Monticello RMP Revision.

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK